Proceedings of International Conference on Applied Science and Health
(No. 4, 2019)
Science for the mankind: Translating research results into policy and practices

ICASH-A105

THE LEADERSHIP ROLE FOR A SUCCESSFUL CHANGE MANAGEMENT: A SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW

Meike Magnasofa [1]*, **Mardiati Najib** [2]

[1,2]*Magister of Hospital Administration, Public Health Faculty, University of Indonesia*

*Corresponding author's email: meike.magnasofa@ui.ac.id

ABSTRACT

Background: *Globally there are significant concerns about the role of leadership in the disruptive era where change is inevitable. Organization needs a leader who can response those changes toward right direction to sustain. This review is to identify a more comprehensive relation between the leadership role and change management in the organization and its associated factors drawing upon systematic review of literatures published in the last ten years.*

Methods: *This study used systematic literature review based on the PRISMA (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews & Meta-Analyses) protocol to identify all the published articles using relevant keywords. We searched in Emerald Insight (2010-2019), Science Direct (2010-2019), and EBSCOhost (2010-2019) to retrieve relevant articles published in English language only between January 2010 and April 2019. The review used key terms and phrases associated with Leadership, Change Management, and Disruptive. The abstracts were reviewed according to inclusion criteria and quality assessment.*

Results*: From 16,658 authors finally include 6 papers in this review. By the review, we noted that it is almost impossible to avoid change although resistance to change is real. There is a positive relation between leadership role and successful change management. The most significant subject and contributor for the successful change are the culture of change within the organization and the effective communication between leaders and their subordinates. The hindrances of change are lack of authority, uncertainly of role and lack of time and focus from the leaders. The findings of the study can be relevant for variety of settings as the study was conducted across cultures and sectors.*

Conclusions: *Leaders need to understand and spread the ambience with their employee of 4 points; the clarity about the needs of change in their organization, the key alignments, complementary development strategies and critical enablement. The recommendation for future research is to review more leadership studies on disruptive era in health care sector only in order to get deeper understanding in homogeneity setting. For policy makers, it is suggested to design policy that enforces leaders to improve their leadership skill and updating knowledge.*

Keywords: *Leadership Role, Change Management, Disruptive*

INTRODUCTION

Leadership theories have been evolving from time to time, the belief that only certain people actually born to be a leader is slowly fading and became irrelevant. The "Great Man Theory" by Thomas Carlyle in 1847, which claimed that leaders are born and only those who are endowed with heroic potential could ever became the leaders has been steadily transforming into leaders are defined by the situation, context, culture, working environment, subordinates, organizational complexities and many other factors [1]. It means, nowadays leadership is believed it is determined by a continuous flexible developmental process to adapt to both internal and external changing.

Globally, there are significant concerns about the role of leadership in the uncertain period, therefore, in this disruptive era, it is extremely crucial that leaders promote initiatives so that the organization able to sustain and successfully compete in changing environment and deliver their organization to be flexible in all aspects [2]. Moran and Brightman defined Change Management as "the process of continually renewing an organization's directions, structure and capability to serve the ever-changing needs of external and internal customer [2]. The effort to develop organizational change management will likely be achieved when the leader surely understand the hesitance to change, the sequence of changing process, and the strategy to conquer the change. Connor in 1995 reveal the reasons why people reluctant to change, that are lack of trust, belief that changing is unnecessary, belief that changing is impossible, economical treat, relatively high cost, fear of self-failure, compromising the power of authority, threaten to the value and idealism, and the reluctance to be controlled [3]. The attempt of this review is to identify a more comprehensive relation between the leadership role and change management in the organization in disruptive era and its associated factors drawing upon systematic review of literatures.

METHODS
Search Strategy
We located studies using electronic database, in this review were Emerald Insight, Science Direct, and EBSCOhost published between 2010 and 2019. Selection of eligible articles for this study using the PRISMA (*Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews & Meta-Analyses*) protocol. Irrelevant articles through the process of identification, screening, and eligibility were eliminated [4].

Document Selection
We carried out computer searches using keywords Leadership, Change Management and Disruptive. The keywords should be found on the title or in the abstract of the journals. With Science Direct, initially found 16,658 articles, then we limit the findings only to articles that were written the longest was 10 years ago that is between 2010-2019 and it was found 9.425 articles. To be more specific we limit again into the research articles that published on Social and Behavioral Sciences journals, we then found 169 articles. After we fast read the abstract, we found one article that relevant with the topic of discussion. We did the same pathway for each search engine including Emerald Insight. The first finding on the keyword, 7.547 articles were found. The next screen was the journal that categorized as Management and Human Resources Journals including International Journal of Organizational Analysis, Strategic HR Review, and Journal of Integrated Care, 148 articles found. We then screen the findings by research paper only and we found 52 articles. Manual searching by reading the abstract follows this up and finally we found 5 articles that relevant.

Eligibility Criteria
To ensure that we clearly understand the content, we only include the articles in English language that have been published in the International Conferences. We also established the inclusion criteria. First, studies had to have topic that made explicitly clear and relevant with the issues discussed in our Literature Review. The exclusion criteria was articles that employed specific research in a specific subject knowledge such as in medical science, economic, laws, manufactures/industrial, air nor public transportation, biosecurity, fashion industry, primary school setting, IT, mental health etc. Clearly, we wanted the social science researches that discuss Leadership and Change Management in a general knowledge. Secondly, the selection criterion was for the research article or academic journals with full paper access only.

Data Extraction
Extraction and data analysis were performed in the individual-level studies, we then classified the articles into six separate groups, as presented on the following table; place/setting, field, subject, variables or key elements, method or approach and main findings.

RESULTS

Relevant to variety of settings

Based on the criteria formulated in the method section, we included 6 articles in this review that consist of 3 narrative articles, 2 quantitative research using questionnaires and telephone survey, and 1 qualitative study by interviewing the subject until no further variation in response. The research were conducted in 4 different countries; UK, USA, Scotland, and UAE within the variety of fields including health sector, social welfare, housing, stocks, business, IT and financial institutions on both public and private organizations. The diversity and heterogeneity of the setting would broaden the understanding of what are the crucial points of leadership and its impact on change in many sectors and cultures. The similarity of the results in this review, therefore, confidently to be generalized in a wider setting [5].

Positive relation between leadership role and successful change management

Main findings of this review have fulfilled the initial intention to identify comprehensive relation between the leadership role and change management. It is found that effective leadership has positively and significantly effects on the successful organizational change in disruptive era. Change in inevitable, and it is impossible can be done without leaders as a change agent. Many scholars argue that mobilizing change that started by introduction of change, sustain the change and eventually evaluating the change requires effective leadership [6][7]. Effective leadership includes the capability to manage natural resistance to change. Lewis and colleagues believe that resistance is an expected part of the change process, thus employees resist change because they are human, not because they are disloyal or incompetent [8].

Culture of change

A strong culture of change within organization was also discussed in most articles and 2 articles were exploring deeply. Al-Ali and colleagues found that the hierarchical organizational culture plays a major positive role in emergent and planned change [6]. Rose claimed that strengthening the culture of change within organization as the major strategy, he believes that strong culture stretch people to perform beyond their limit [9].

Communications for a successful change

Almost all articles, except Al-Ali and peers, discussing about "communication" as their key point for a successful organizational change. Fraser and Hemmings emphasizing the importance to communicate "why" the change needed and "how" to achieve that [10], Rose focusing on the professional fitness that is include the capability to communicate during the uncertainty and turbulence [9], Lunts in his research found that all interviewees highlighted the critical importance of a clear steer and vision from superiors [11]. Moreover, Battilana and colleagues use the capability to communicate as a variable in the research [7], while Lewis and her associates have pointed "managing natural resistance to change" as number one of 6 key imperatives and certainly communication play the significant role there [8].

The hindrances of change

The review also found the crucial points that hinder the successfully change management. Lunts in his qualitative study among middle managers revealed that a perceived lack of authority and the uncertainty surrounding their roles were the major hindrances beside lack of time and focus from their superiors [11]. Al-Ali and partners found on both planned and emergent change in public organization will not be possible to be achieved without the enforcement from the legal authority as hierarchical organizational culture found to be most prominent factors on change [6]. While the rest of the articles stated that lack of communication including poor manage of the natural resistance and inadequate understandings of human's reaction toward changing are the most contributors why change fails [7][8][9][10].

Proceedings of International Conference on Applied Science and Health
(No. 4, 2019)
Science for the mankind: Translating research results into policy and practices

No	Title and Author	Year	Place/Setting (Public/Private)	Field	Subject	Variables/ Key Elements	Method/Approach	Main Findings
1	A Change for the Better – Judith Fraser, Catherine Hemmings. (9)	2010	United Kingdom / Private	Housing, Stocks, IT	60 Managers from all levels	1. Planning Change 2. Communicating Change 3. Managing Change	Narrative paper looks at background to the need, highlighted employee concerns regarding management and communication of change, outline the development and strategy for learning	Understanding "Why" the change needed and knowing "How" to achieve that are the fundamental points to success. Imposing change without communication and consultation serves only to widen the gap
2	Achieving Leadership Behavior Change at Scale – Tom Rose. (8)	2018	USA / Public and Private	All sectors of business	HR Leaders and the Consulting firms	1. Clarity about the need 2. Key alignments 3. Complementary development strategy 4. Critical enablement	The study summarizes new research on leadership and organizational high performance and practices. It relates these findings to trend evidenced in the work being done by HR organizations that serve them	Key Strategies: 1. Focusing on Professional Fitness (Closing the know-do gap and Closing the impact gap) 2. Strengthening the culture of leadership (Strong cultures stretch people to perform beyond their intrinsic talents)
3.	Change Management in Integrated Care: What Helps and Hinders Middle Managers (a Case Study) – Phillips Lunts. (10)	2012	Scotland / Public	Health and Social welfare	Middle Managers	The study aims to explore what Middle Managers perceived as helping and hindering them in the delivery of change	Qualitative Research, Semi-structured interview to 8 Middle Managers. Issues were tested until there appeared to be no further variation in responses	Significant hindrances: lack of clarity role and lack of time and focus from their Superiors Helping : informal network and practical guideline on dealing with change

Proceedings of International Conference on Applied Science and Health
(No. 4, 2019)
Science for the mankind: Translating research results into policy and practices

No	Title and Author	Year	Place/Setting (Public/Private)	Field	Subject	Variables/ Key Elements	Method/Approach	Main Findings
4	Change Management through Leadership: the Mediating Role of Organizational Culture – Abdulla Ahmed Al-Ali, Sanjay Kumar Singh, Moza Al-Nahyan, Amrik Singh Sohal. (5)	2017	United Arab Emirates / Public	8 Public-sectors service organizations that regulate Economic and Commercial affairs	Middle Managements	Variables: 1. Organizational Culture (Clan, Adhocracy, Hierarchy) 2. Change Leadership 3. Change Management (Planned, Emergent)	Combine method: Literature Review was performed to determine the Hypothesis, and then Quantitative research was conducted using a standard questionnaire. Sample size: 210 Middle-managers who had worked in the organization for a minimum 2 years	1. Change Leadership positively and significantly impacts the three dimensions of organizational cultures 2. Hierarchical organizational culture plays a major positive role in emergent and planned change 3. Organizational culture esp. Hierarchical positively and significantly influences change management 4. There is no significant impact of the clan and adhocracy cultures on either emergent or planned change 5. There is a positive and partial mediation effect of hierarchical culture on the relationship between leadership and organizational change management

No	Title and Author	Year	Place/Setting (Public/Private)	Field	Subject	Variables/ Key Elements	Method/Approach	Main Findings
5	Leadership Competencies for Implementing planned organizational change – Julie Battilana, Mattia Gilmartin, Metin Sengul, Anne-Claire Pache, Jeffrey Alexander. (6)	2010	United Kingdom / Public	NHS (National Health Service)	89 Clinical Managers (Middle and Top Management); 21 physicians, 41 nurses, 27 allied health	Independent Variable: Leadership Competency (Person-oriented, Task-oriented) Dependent variable: Implementing planned organizational change (Communicating, Mobilizing, Evaluating) Control Variables: Project type, Organization size, Career-specific characteristic	Combine method: Literature Review was performed to determine the Hypothesis, then Prospective Quantitative research was conducted using a 360-degree leadership survey and refine their change project description in 3 months after the project started, then followed up by telephone survey after 12 months of project implementation	1. Leaders who are highly skilled in both person-oriented and task-oriented behaviors are likely to be more effective than other leaders 2. Leaders who are more effective in task-oriented behavior are more likely to focus on both mobilizing and evaluating activities. They more focus on establishing the system or redesigning the process to support change 3. Leaders who are more effective in person-oriented behavior are more likely to focus on Communicating the need of change. They are good at Inspiring and mobilizing of the team 4. Leaders implementing project in large organizations were more likely to emphasize the communicating activities

Proceedings of International Conference on Applied Science and Health
(No. 4, 2019)
Science for the mankind: Translating research results into policy and practices

No	Title and Author	Year	Place/Setting (Public/Private)	Field	Subject	Variables/ Key Elements	Method/Approach	Main Findings
6	Successfully Managing Change during Uncertain times – Evelyn Lewis, Don Romanaggi, Aimie Chapple. (7)	2010	USA / Public and Private	Health, Social and Financial organizations	Executives and Managers	6 Key Imperatives: 1. Manage natural resistance to change 2. Sustain performance in an environment of constant change 3. Personalize the benefits of change 4. Lead, sponsor and communicate throughout the change 5. Support people through the difficult points 6. Focus on new behavior, not new attitudes	Narrative article based on hands-on experience in the field of organizational change management consulting in more than 2 decades	New Mindset, skills and execution capability are important to deliver successful change within organization. Successful implementation of change requires an understanding of the human response to change.

Proceedings of International Conference on Applied Science and Health
(No. 4, 2019)
Science for the mankind: Translating research results into policy and practices

DISCUSSION

Understanding the need to change in members of organization is the key so people would voluntarily support the change although it means going out from their comfort zones. Without allowing communication or appreciate the reasons for their subordinates to express their feeling and fears toward the change, it is less likely the trust and confidence will be built. Leaders must clear up any confusion through clear communication. They should know and cater to what motivates their people. Change leaders provide passion and a strong sense of purpose about change. As mentioned by Rao, leader must share the vision with their employees so that they feel that they are an integral part of the change process [12]. Strategic communication as the essential point of planning, managing and evaluating the change also discussed in many recent articles [13].

There is a consistency on positive relation between effective leadership roles with the successful change management. The leader skill and competency plays a significant role to initiate and maintain the changing process in their organization. To mastering the change of their organization especially in disruptive era, leaders need to have the new mindset, understanding of their employee, time availability and the execution capability [8]. This finding align with previous studies which stated the better skill of the leader on managing the change, the better change will be achieved [14]. Mitki and team in their study also found the strong leadership bringing the external forces into alignment with internal forces that enable the organization to adopt the external change. Therefore, the leadership role is the core for a successful change management as it is able to transform shared understanding into action [15].

CONCLUSION

Leadership plays a great role on the successful change management in many setting of organization. Leaders need to understand and spread the ambience with their employee of 4 points; the clarity about the needs of change in their organization, manage natural resistance to change, complementary development strategies and personalized the benefit of change. [10][8].

The recommendation for future research is to review more leadership studies on disruptive era in health care sector only in order to get deeper understanding in homogeneity setting. For policy makers, it is suggested to design policy that enforce leaders to improve their leadership skill and updating knowledge on the latest policies, public concerns including both national and international trends that relevant to their organization by attending recommended trainings, seminars or workshops. The organization also need to impose the policy to conduct regular meetings between leaders and their subordinates to share the vision, discuss strategy to manage natural resistance to change and build effective communication.

REFERENCES

1. Zaker AK, Nawaz A, Khan I. Leadership Theories and Styles: A Literature Review. Journal of Resources Development Management. 2016;16(2):1–7.
2. Gwaka, A., Gidion, O., Mayianda R. Organisational Change : A Critical Review of the Literature. International Journal of Profesional Management. 2016;11(2):1–6.
3. Yukl G. Kepemimpinan Dalam Organisasi *(Leadership in organization)*. 5th ed. Jakarta: PT Index; 2010.
4. Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, Altman DG, Altman D, Antes G, et al. Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses: The PRISMA Statement. PLoS Medicine. 2009;6(7):1–6.
5. Norreklit H, Norreklit L, Mitchell F. Understanding practice generalisation - Opening the research/practice gap. Qualitative Research in Accounting Management. 2016;13(3):278–302.
6. Al-Ali AA, Singh SK, Al-Nahyan M, Sohal AS. Change management through leadership: the mediating role of organizational culture. International Journal Organization Analysis. 2017;25(4):723–739.
7. Battilana J, Gilmartin M, Sengul M, Pache AC, Alexander JA. Leadership competencies for implementing planned organizational change. The Leadership Quarterly.2010;21(3):422–438.
8. Lewis E, Romanaggi D, Chapple A, Lewis E, Romanaggi D, Chapple A. Successfully managing change during uncertain times. Strategic HR Review 2014;9 (2):12-18.
9. Rose T. Achieving leadership behavior change at scale. Strategic HR Review. 2018;17(6):309–318.
10. Fraser J, Hemmings C, Fraser J, Hemmings C. A change for the better. Strategic HR Review. 2012; 9(2):25-31
11. Lunts P. Change management in integrated care: What helps and hinders middle managers - A case study. Journal of Integrated Care.

2012;20(4):246–256.

12. Rao M. The Tools and Techniques of Effective Change Management: Why some Reformers Succeed while Others Fail. Human Resource Management International Digest. 2015;23(1):35–37.

13. Thompson SA, Miller KL. Disruptive trends in higher education: Leadership skills for successful leaders. Journal Profesional of Nursing. 2018;34(2):92–96.

14. Joergensen HH, Owen L, Neus A. Stop improvising change management!. Strategy and Leadership. 2009;37(2):38–44

15. Mitki Y, Shani AB, Stjernberg T. Leadership, development and learning mechanisms: System transformation as a balancing act. Leadership Organizational Development Journal. 2008;29(1):68–84.